

YOU BEAUTIFUL, CURITIBA: DIGITAL MEDIA, IDENTITY AND CITIZENSHIP

Virginia Borges Kistmann
Federal University of Paraná, Brazil

ABSTRACT

This article deals with design and communication aimed at smart cities. Being a smart city has been a strategy adopted by many cities. Based on information and communication technologies (ICT), they aim to attract investment, increase competitiveness and thus improve the quality of life of its residents and visitors. Therefore, the generation of objects and communication elements made available by municipalities widely, both in physical and digital form, is part of this process. Studies on the role of design in cities have been developed, especially in Europe, with recent repercussions in Brazil. However, little is known about how municipalities appropriated these new technologies to strengthen local identity and to promote citizenship, characterizing them as a smart city. Thus, this study is based on the role of design associated with digital media currently to understand its contribution to self-conscious, independent and attentive citizen behavior. Considering that Curitiba is named a smart city, the study presented here aims to identify the way the city government considers the communication elements associated with its projects. As a method, a field study was conducted taking into account the images posted on Instagram of the same city, supported by studies on the impact of globalization as in Castells (2006), the concepts of non-place (Augé, 1994) and “digital swarm” (Han, 2018). The study demonstrates the importance of the political role of these insertions to the result in acts that helps the construction of citizenship.

KEYWORDS

design; digital media; Instagram; smart cities; Curitiba

CURITIBA, MINHA LINDA: MÉDIA DIGITAIS, IDENTIDADE E CIDADANIA

RESUMO

Este artigo trata da comunicação via design voltada para as cidades inteligentes. Ser uma cidade inteligente tem sido uma estratégia adotada por várias cidades. Com base nas tecnologias da informação e comunicação (TIC), cidades inteligentes visam atrair investimentos, aumentando a competitividade, e, assim, melhorar a qualidade de vida de seus moradores e visitantes. Por isso, a geração de objetos e elementos de comunicação disponibilizados pelos municípios, tanto na forma física quanto na digital, faz parte desse processo. Nesse sentido, estudos sobre o papel do design nas cidades vêm sendo desenvolvidos, principalmente na Europa, com repercussões recentes no Brasil. Porém, pouco se sabe como os municípios se apropriaram dessas novas tecnologias para fortalecer a identidade local e promover a cidadania, caracterizando-as como cidades inteligentes. Assim, este artigo discute o papel do design associado aos média digitais atualmente em uso, buscando entender sua contribuição para o comportamento do cidadão auto consciente, independente e atento. Considerando que Curitiba se auto nomeia uma cidade inteligente, o estudo aqui apresentado tem como objetivo identificar a maneira pela qual o

governo da cidade considera os elementos de comunicação associados aos seus projetos. Como método, realiza um estudo de campo, levando em consideração as imagens postadas no Instagram, link da mesma cidade, e os estudos sobre a sociedade em rede (Castells, 2006), os conceitos de não-lugar (Augé, 1994) e de “enxame digital” (Han, 2018). Como resultado, o estudo aponta a relevância no avanço de pesquisas que considerem o papel político dessas inserções, para que o resultado das ações venha a contribuir para a construção da cidadania.

PALAVRAS-CHAVE

design; mídia digitais; Instagram; cidades inteligentes; Curitiba

INTRODUCTION

More and more, public policies consider that urban investments depend not only on physical infrastructure, but also on communication elements and social infrastructure. For Caragliu, del Bo and Nijkamp (2011), this human and social capital strengthens local identities and contributes decisively to the attractiveness that cities offer, making them smart cities. Thus, in addition to the attractiveness resulting from good performance in economy, governance, environment, mobility, people and way of life, the so-called smart cities should seek in information and communication technologies (ICT) ways to reinforce self-decision, in a way to make citizens independent and attentive¹.

The adjective intelligent, from the version for the expression smart city in Portuguese, considerably reduces the notion of the term in English. The English word smart means elegance, cunning, sharpness, aptitude, skill, among other concepts². Therefore, in this work we are not only considering the intelligent concept, in the sense of using mental capacities to find solutions, but also the other variants, including their political reverberation.

Following this thought, a smart city demands that design activities must be supported in the search for solutions that will contribute to the construction of a new context, in which, increasingly, the development of citizenship is built. Thus, this study is based on the issue of sending and receiving messages linked by public institutions, based on digital media. It starts with communication elements resulting from digital design and service design, seeking to improve the quality of life of its population.

Digital design is understood here as the result of the graphic design that uses digital media³. As for service design, it is understood as one that seeks to plan and organize people, infrastructure, communication and material components of a service in order to improve its quality and interaction between the organization that offers it and its users (Gibson, 2017).

¹ See https://ec.europa.eu/info/eu-regional-and-urban-development/topics/cities-and-urban-development/city-initiatives/smart-cities_en

² See <https://www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/smart>

³ Retrieved from https://learn.org/articles/What_is_a_Digital_Designer.html

Methodologically, Andrade (2018) highlights the need to include in contemporary research a hybridization between current scientific rationalities, the sociability of new media and the recent sensitivities of the arts, these here considered as a design field. Thus, for its realization, this article was based on this tripod, taking into account a field study, in which it analyzes the images and posts of users and administrators of the city hall website of the city of Curitiba, Brazil. The analysis of the field study is thus based on a theoretical contribution, from the point of view of the sociability in using the media and its design.

This article is structured as follows: first, a discussion is presented regarding the theories that deal with communication associated with digital media and public policies; then, aspects related to the construction of public space and the participation of its members are theoretically discussed; after, there is the presentation of data found in the field, with ethnographic digital exploratory research; next, finally, the final considerations about the study follow.

PUBLIC POLICIES, DIGITAL MEDIA AND DESIGN

For Castells (2006, p. 23), in the network society, communication constitutes a public space, which sets the “cognitive space in which people’s minds receive information and form their points of view through the processing of signals from society as a whole”. Through it, the different actors interact and create relationships between institutions and social organizations. Even when the final information is processed by an individual, according to his own personal characteristics, “the dynamics of social communication is essential in the formation of conscience and opinion, and the basis of the political decision-making process” (Castells, 2006, p. 23). Therefore, design activities aimed at communication between public agents and people must bear in mind these aspects, which are important in the formation of citizenship.

Castells also says:

since politics is largely dependent on the public space of communication in society, the political process is transformed according to the conditions of the culture of real virtuality. Political opinions and political behavior are formed in the space of communication. (Castells, 2006, p. 24)

However, the way the media space acts on people’s minds is supported by a presence/absence mechanism of messages which, in a binary way, has direct consequences for the political process and social institutions. This mechanism implies the fact that presence in the media is essential to build political hegemony (Castells, 2006).

Several cities have been investing in order to bring their citizens closer to political actions via social media. These movements have been considered as a search for a new nature of the dialogue between the State and the citizens, making it more reciprocal, open and changing (Mulgan, 2006).

One example of design used in actions developed by cities is the work conducted over the years by Amsterdam. According to Hefting (2008), Amsterdam supported its government decisions on managers and marketing experts together with designers. From this relationship, they produced one of the most prominent expressions in the field of graphic design: that of the Dutch postal service. In this case, the emphasis was on the language explored in posters, stamps, documents.

Hefting (2008) highlights that “graphic design is a way of communicating and, therefore, a path to power and the possibility of manipulation” (p. 284). In this sense, for him, neoliberalism, as a capitalist manifestation, is linked to different authorities, managers and even artistic institutions. It allows designers certain liberties and provocative expressions, but within certain limits.

Another example of design used in public policy has been developed by the United Kingdom. For years, a series of activities have been implemented, either by governmental initiative or through other organizations. As an example, in Figure 1, below, we see one of these activities, the one developed by “mySociety Limited”⁴, a project by the UK Citizens Online Democracy, in which citizens were asked to participate.

Empowering residents of tower blocks



4th September 2019 by Jen

An estimated 100,000 people in the UK live in tower blocks. If you're one of them, mySociety's current project will be of particular interest — and please read on to the end of the post, where you'll find out how you might get involved. mySociety has been working with the campaign group Tower Blocks UK...

Figure 1: September 4 mySociety call

Source: <https://www.mysociety.org>

The expansion of design activities by the British government has been substantial in recent years, supported by the Design Council. Currently, it is considered that there are more than 600 designers/offices involved in activities aimed at offering services⁵.

In another experience, in Medford, Massachusetts, the use of a digital platform on the internet helped to engage local residents in the redesign of a park. Through it he tested the perception of the goals defined by the local city hall and raised visions for a new conception. The platform used assisted the design team in obtaining feedback from residents on design options and offered insights to designers on the quality of engagement and building citizens' social capital (Ruggeri & Young, 2016).

Ruggeri and Young (2016) highlight some results regarding these insertions: the construction of a common history enriches the projects, offering a common basis for civic life; technology can be used as a way to update ongoing projects; citizens participate gradually and with nuances, but their contribution must be full; and there is a constant need for experimentation and improvement. Thus, through digital media, planners have

⁴ See <https://www.mysociety.org>

⁵ Retrieved from <https://www.facebook.com/mari.suoheimo.3>

obtained a better understanding of the territories for which they project, in relation to the communities and environments in which they live, through the participation of users in their construction. The proposals for new designs by digital media can be enriched through projects that are jointly prepared. Ruggeri and Young (2016) consider, however, that, although incorporating the participation of a large portion of the population, contact on a local scale and face-to-face interactions are important.

These experiences demonstrate that designers have sought to contribute to the construction of the notion of citizens' belonging, with the proposal of project activities that include citizen participation. However, these trends have some complexity, because especially the dynamics in public involvement can raise expectations that even in successful programs can cause disillusionment (Mulgan, 2006).

Contreras and Sanches (2018) point out that contemporary visual practices for political purposes pose new questions regarding the knowledge of art and, we could add, to design. Politics and political doctrines need and give rise to images, but political ideas are also present in images. For this reason, it is necessary to introduce the epistemic perspective of visual studies that conceives the visual as a social and cultural construction.

Whiteley (1993) was one of the first to discuss the theme of design for the collective good. He states that when making public policy decisions, the basis for actions supported by the population is important. According to him: "a user-oriented design movement could, in other words, be radical and socially progressive rather than reactionary and socially divisive" (Whiteley, 1993, p. 170). This attitude is also observed in Castells and Cardoso (2006), who point out that, in the context of digital media and the use of platforms such as Facebook and Instagram, through the dialogue that these media allow, the possibility of a more open and democratic society would be verified, which would allow the discovery of new civic life *terrains*. Due to its characteristics, together with other traditional methods, digital media could facilitate consensus and promote social changes (Castells & Cardoso, 2006).

However, on the contrary, extreme tension can be observed, as in political use, exemplified in the case of the company Cambridge Analytics, which specializes in the use of data mining for electoral purposes. In Brazil, Ideia Big Data is offering data mining services to politicians using methods similar to Cambridge Analytics' Ocean⁶. This method is supported by the work of Michal Kosinski, which consists of collecting online data from cell phones and from them defining psychological types, which can be influenced by information directly linked to them⁷.

In a video, Alexander Nix, from Cambridge Analytics promotes the use of micro data for effective advertising campaigns. His Youtube video⁸ brings example of two very emblematic messages. One, that has a sign prohibiting the use of a beach, which says: "public use ends here, private property"; and another that has a red flag with a danger

⁶ See <https://tab.uol.com.br/noticias/redacao/2019/08/14/empresa-brasileira-esta-vendendo-metodo-cambridge-analytics-para-politicos.htm>

⁷ See <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=n8Dd5aVXLcC>

⁸ Retrieved from <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=n8Dd5aVXLcC>

sign and the image of a shark, with the message: “shark in sight”. As he explains, the objective of banning access in two languages is aimed at different audiences, with different behavioral communications. Nix’s explanation demonstrates that we are prisoners of the aspects of our personality that move us about the decisions we make in the face of communication elements offered by the media.

Han (2018) claims that this situation stems from the fact that “the society of control has its consummation there, where the inhabitants communicate not by external coercion, but by internal need” (Han, 2018, pp. 121-122). He continues:

data-mining makes visible the collective models of behavior, of which you are not even aware as an individual. (...) Psychopower is more efficient (...) insofar as it monitors, controls and influences human beings, not from without, but from within. Psychopolitics empowers the social behavior of the masses by accessing its unconscious logic. The digital surveillance society, which has access to the collective unconscious, to the future social behavior of the masses, develops totalitarian traits. It delivers us to psychopolitical programming and control. (Han, 2018, pp. 133-134)

These questions lead to another approach regarding the real participation of citizens in the participatory construction of the social capital of cities, as can be seen below.

THE SPECTACLE OF THE SWARM IN NON-PLACES

Following Han (2018), despite the positive effects presented by several authors, some considerations expressed by theorists in the field of sociology raise questions about the real participation of designers in the construction of a smart city through digital media.

Discussing modern society, Debord (2003) considers that, due to its characteristics, in the communication processes there would be an inversion of the real, so that the lived reality is invaded by the contemplation of the spectacle and remakes the spectacular order by positive adhesion, leading to seeing without distance.

Debord also brings another observation: for him in the society of the spectacle “what appears is good, what is good appears” (Debord, 2003, p. 12). This conception requires a passive attitude, supported by appearance. He says:

the management of this society and all contact between people can no longer be exercised except through this power of instantaneous communication, that is why such “communication” is essentially unilateral; its concentration translates into accumulating in the hands of the management of the existing system means that allow him to continue administering. The generalized split of the spectacle is inseparable from the modern State, the general form of the split in society, the product of the division of social labor and the organ of class domination. (Debord, 2003, pp. 15- 16)

In this society, innovation has a predominant role, but in the field of culture it tends to overcome its own cultural assumptions and moves towards the suppression of all separation.

The spectacle is the ideology par excellence, because it fully exposes and manifests the essence of any ideological system: the impoverishment, submission and denial of real life. The show is, materially, “the expression of the separation and distance between man and man”. (Debord, 2003, p. 135)

In this sense, the concept of non-place presented by Augé (1994) comes close to the concept of the society of the spectacle of Debord (2003), because for him the non-place is a space for others, but without their presence, a space constituted in spectacle (Sá, 2014). Thus, it is considered that the dynamics of communication occurs at a locus. In this case, it occurs through digital media, being linked to a physical place, the city, which is constituted in a specific territory.

In this way, the place is different from the non-place, because the first refers to history, tradition and, one might add, identity. These elements allow the recognition of individuals as belonging to their places and the construction of an emotional connection with the place where they live. In the non-place, however, spaces are not identity, they are not relational, and they are not historical (Sá, 2014). Non-places allow for a

great circulation of people, things and images in a single space, on the other hand they transform the world into a spectacle with which we maintain relations based on images, transforming us into spectators of a deeply codified place, of which no one is truly a part. (Sá, 2014, p. 3)

Han (2018) advances in this point of view, saying with respect to digital media that

we are deprogrammed through this new media, without being able to fully understand this radical paradigm shift. We crawl behind digital media, which, far from conscious decision, decisively transforms our behavior, our perception, our sensation, our thinking, our life together. We are intoxicated today by digital media, without being able to fully assess the consequences of this drunkenness. This blindness and the simultaneous stupidity constitute the current crisis. (Han, 2018, p. 10)

Therefore, for him, this attitude would lead to a society of scandal. He claims that distance establishes respect and, when respect disappears, the public sphere is lost. For it to happen it is necessary to leave. The digital society would deconstruct the spatial distance accompanied by the erosion of mental distance (Han, 2018).

If for Castells (2006) in the new network sociability, the emergence of individualism occurs, from the logic of digital technology, for Han (2018), in the digital cluster we have singular individuals. “Individuals merge into a new unit, in which they no longer have any profile of their own”. The digital cluster, unlike the mass, is not in itself coherent (Han, 2018, p. 27).

Han (2018) also considers that the lack of distance leads to a mixture between the private and the public. However, even so, power relations remain: “the gift of power reduces the improbability of the acceptance of my selection of the course of action, of my decision of will on the part of others” (2018, p. 17). Therefore, he claims that the scandal society does not allow any indignation.

This contradicts what Castells (2006) points out, when he claims that

an innovative but pragmatic policy will have to find a halfway point between what is socially and politically feasible, in each context, and the promotion of cultural and organizational conditions for creativity in which innovation, power, wealth and culture are based on the network society. (p. 29)

In contrast, Han (2018) says that *homo digitalis* does not meet and, therefore, does not build a “us”. Behaving like swarms, volatile, these groups differ from the traditional mass, which by their common action generates power. In the “digital swarm” they dissolve quickly. That is why they do not develop any political energy. Their subjects are not able to act collectively and thus lead to a society in which the spaces for joint action shrink radically and prevent the formation of a questioning counterpower. Therefore, there would be “a generalized disintegration of the common and the community” (Han, 2018, p. 33).

In addition, Han (2018) considers that digital media have a temporality of the immediate present, in which information is produced, sent and received without mediation. In this sense, there is no longer content to consume information in a passive way, since digital averages allow you to actively produce and communicate what you want. In this way, political representation loses strength, threatening representative democracy. Due to the total transparency, digital media force a temporality that “makes long-term and slow planning impossible. It is no longer possible to let things mature. (...) Under the dictatorship of transparency, deviating opinions or unusual ideals do not even have a voice” (Han, 2018, pp. 39-40).

Paradoxically, digital media keep us far from each other more and more. And they take us away from the real. Through an iconic inversion, the images look more vivid, more beautiful and better than the perceived reality. Images are domesticated when they are consumable, their truth is taken from them. In them, age, destiny and time are frozen. Thus, gifts that do not bloom or shine only in what has shade and shine (Han, 2018).

Sá (2014) contributes to this discussion by highlighting Augé: being empirically identifiable spaces, but also spaces created by the look that takes it as an object, the non-places of some are the places of the other. In the virtualization of spaces, we become others, without realizing it and we have the impression that we are being colonized, without knowing by whom. In this sense, Sá (2014, p. 3) states that

the question that always seems to be underlying Augé’s thinking is to know how “non-places” can cause us a loss of ourselves as a group and society,

with only the “lonely” individual now prevailing. (...) But what is happening today, in the period that Augé called supermodernity, marked by the excesses of events, images and spatial and individual references (cf. Augé, 1994a), is the loss of the category of the other.

The “non-places” would thus be multifunctional spaces, whose objective is to enable each one to do more and more things in the same space. They are spaces to consume, and to create “new needs”, between them advertising and information (Sá, 2014).

Augé also states that supermodernity produces non-places. Place and non-places are opposed: the former is never completely erased, and the latter never fully realized, so that the game of identity and relationship is constantly re-established (Augé, 1994, p. 74).

Non-places would be places of consumption and creation of new needs. For this reason, it is considered that the semiotic interpretation of cyber culture demands an approach in which object and subject are fused, companies, designers, consumers, products become faces of a single coin.

A semiotic interpretation of digital culture means giving a meaning structure to a space, without necessarily relying on a particular one, or at a specific time. This is because “digital culture is based on the counter finger” (Han, 2018, p. 66). If the story is a narrative, in digital culture “the screen does not tell any life story, no biography. It is additive, not narrative” (Han, 2018, p. 66).

In this sense, it is considered that information differs from knowledge. Knowledge is not available. Long experience precedes it, unlike information, which is short-term. Therefore, power and information do not combine with each other, as power is marked by interiority. Due to the lack of asymmetry, digital media generate a genuinely communicative relationship, symmetrical communication. The recipient of the information is at the same time the sender and, therefore, power relations are difficult.

In addition, digital media created a new social, political and economic geography. They thus alter the notion of community and identity. The feeling of belonging is then affected and, if for Flusser, “in the digital point universe, all fixed quantities dissolve. There is neither subject nor object (...) today, the Self is still just a nodal point of intersecting virtualities” (Han, 2018, p. 83).

For Han (2018), the digital connection “does not consist of points devoid of themselves and of intersections, but of narcissistic islands of egos” (Han, 2018, p. 83). In truth, the digital community erodes us. “It destroys public space and sharpens the individualization of the human being” (Han, 2018, p. 86).

In this universe,

digital photography puts the truth of photography radically in question. It definitely ends the era of representation. It marks the end of the real. It no longer contains any reference to the real. (...) Hyperphotography opens a self-referential, hyper-real space, which is completely decoupled from the referent. (Han, 2018, p. 111)

For this reason, Hefting (2008) states that it is easier to interact through a web page than through a printed medium. And it complements:

humor, understatements, intentional ugliness, illegibility or hermetically closed concepts, traditions, a personal “brand” of identity, decorations, repetitions, kitsch, subversion, complexity, the anonymous photography model, clichés, new symbols: all these are characteristics that make graphic design to develop a polarity difficult to untangle. Sometimes it feels more like entertainment than meaningful design. A variety of options are offered, from image variations (...), due to the surprising rapid advances in technology. It is the time of the hegemony of the seductive image, but also of the autonomous image. (Hefting, 2008, p. 290)

In this new digital media mediated society, “individuals merge into a new unit, in which they no longer have any *profile of their own*. (...) The ‘digital swarm’, unlike the mass, is not in itself coherent” (Han, 2018, p. 27).

COMMUNICATION ON THE CURITIBA CITY HALL WEBSITE: A SMALL SAMPLE TO THINK ABOUT ITS DESIGN

The methodology adopted in this study is of an exploratory nature. It considers a brief study on communication that is established from the digital design and services of the Curitiba City Hall website. It is based on the theoretical foundation on the field of Social Sciences, on digital ethnography (Kozinets, 2017) and on the manifestations of Curitiba’s Facebook⁹, with selected photos of city images. Considering the particularities of Curitiba, it aims to verify in practice how these concepts have been operationalized.

Curitiba, the object of study in this paper, is the capital of the State of Paraná, located in the south of Brazil. It currently has close to two million inhabitants¹⁰ and it is known for its urban planning, mobility policies and sustainable aspects, stimulated by its managers over the last 50 years¹¹. The latest administrations have developed programs for their insertion as a smart city, being considered in 2018 the most intelligent city, in the Brazilian general ranking¹². Therefore, considering studies related to smart cities, Curitiba should promote the citizenship of its members. In addition, Curitiba recently applied to be recognized as a “Design Capital”. The World Design Organization attributes this recognition to cities that demonstrate “effective use of design to boost economic, social, cultural and environmental development”¹³. This

⁹ See <https://www.facebook.com/PrefsCuritiba/>

¹⁰ See <https://cidades.ibge.gov.br/brasil/pr/curitiba/panorama>

¹¹ Retrieved from <http://www.gestaopublica.org.br/mobilidade-urbana-curitiba/> e <https://www.terra.com.br/noticias/climatempo/curitiba-a-cidade-da-sustentabilidade,6c30610a7d73fc1f1faa731272f99b7b3t6s9nn2.html>

¹² Retrieved from <https://www.connectedsmartcities.com.br/2018/09/04/ranking-connected-smart-cities-2018-aponta-curitiba-como-a-bcidade-mais-inteligente-do-pais/>

¹³ Retrieved from <https://wdo.org/programmes/wdc/>

program aims to promote an urban policy guided by design, so that innovation contributes to the better quality of life of its inhabitants.

It corroborates with these data the fact that, for the Curitiba Development and Innovation Agency, linked to the capital city hall, smart cities

are cities that have become more friendly to their citizens, because they bet on innovative planning, with several options mobility, with the spread of green spaces and sustainable solutions for the future, as well as actions to encourage companies that bet on innovation and generate jobs and income.¹⁴

Among the communication actions developed with its citizens, the local city hall has used digital media resources. On Facebook, he maintains a page called “Curitiba City Hall”, where he publicizes his actions and promotes interaction with the citizens of Curitiba¹⁵.

On the homepage of the website is the following text:

we want to talk to you, Curitiba! You, who wake up early to start when the day lights. You, who runs against time and rides a lot to get where you wants. whether the Center or Ganchinho. You, a Curitiba native who came from afar and adopted the capital as his home. Of course, you too, who, like us, were born and raised here and have love it. This, without forgetting you, who come to visit us. When you want somewhere to go, just ask us. Far beyond forests and buildings, Curitiba is made up of people. People who wake up walking in the park and speak the famous phrase “hot milk”. Curitiba of museums and historic centers that remember our past, our history. The Curitiba that was and always will be the ecological city, our beautiful jewel. From Boa Vista to Pinheirinho. From Santa Felicidade to Pilarzinho. From CIC to Cajuru, Boqueirão, Mercês, Ahú ... We want everyone to see themselves here. Questions and complaints? Do not hesitate to come to us, we are here to help you and you can be sure that we will listen to your voice.¹⁶

On the same site, the city invites its users to participate with photos posted on the official Instagram of the City of Curitiba, using the hashtag #curitilover or #curtacuritiba. From it, in some cases, the photos are brought to the home page, most of the time, without comments. When they exist, they refer to the landscape presented. From that post, comments from other users or the administrator are gradually added.

The city’s Facebook had 952,000 followers at the poll’s closing date. Instagram had a total of 181.000 followers, with a total of 631.000 posts.

Curitiba City Hall’s Instagram initially had a policy of requesting images from users, inducing posting. But as of May 2019, that policy has been abandoned. The selection

¹⁴ Retrieved from <https://www.curitiba.pr.gov.br/noticias/saiba-como-curitiba-virou-referencia-nacional-em-smart-city/45072>

¹⁵ See <https://www.facebook.com/PrefsCuritiba/>

¹⁶ Retrieved from <https://www.facebook.com/PrefsCuritiba/>

made in this study was made for convenience and for the most recent temporality, in which the new policy was adopted.

Thus, in this study, publications selected by the City Hall for the Facebook page, from July 22 to September 9, 2019 were based on. The images were analyzed for their graphic elements, the author, the number and content of comments, their views and shares.

These selected images, related to the study period are shown in the figures below.



Figure 2: Image posted on July 22

Source: <https://web.facebook.com/PrefsCuritiba/photos/a.516441535066322/2516910461686076/?type=3&theater>



Figure 3: Image posted on July 26

Source: <https://web.facebook.com/PrefsCuritiba/photos/a.516441535066322/2530529073657548/?type=3&theater>



Figure 4: Image posted on July 28

Source: <https://web.facebook.com/PrefsCuritiba/photos/a.516441535066322/2530276267016162/?type=3&theater>



Figure 5: Image posted on August 1

Source: <https://web.facebook.com/PrefsCuritiba/photos/a.516441535066322/2541528065890982/?type=3&theater>



Figure 6: Image posted on August 11

Source: <https://web.facebook.com/PrefsCuritiba/photos/a.516441535066322/2557116707665451/?type=3&theater>



Figure 7: Image posted on August 19

Source: <https://web.facebook.com/PrefsCuritiba/photos/a.516441535066322/2576549345722187/?type=3&theater>



Figure 8: Image posted on September 6

Source: <https://web.facebook.com/PrefsCuritiba/photos/a.516441535066322/2613891071988014/?type=3&theater>



Figure 9: Imagem posted on September 9

Source: <https://web.facebook.com/PrefsCuritiba/photos/a.516441535066322/2614387631938358/?type=3&theater>

As for the graphic elements, these images are characterized by the following compositional elements: they present images of nature, with flowering trees, sunset and birds; architectural objects representative of the city; and images showing the weather situation at the time of posting: rain and sunny day.

For the study, a table was also created in which the characteristics of the images, in terms of comments, shares and views and likes, were observed, as in Table 1.

DATE	22. July	26. July	28. July	01. August	11. August	19. August	06. September	09. September
PHOTOGRAPHER	@adrikukla	@gab-th_travel	@piacuritano	@dicastellano	@dicastellano	@interajacuritiba	@fischerrafael	@efcs79
COMENTS	63	44	20	270	42	173	97	67
SHARES	171	189	25	1300	37	335	287	128
VISUALIZATIONS/ LIKES	1100	1400	434	3500	532	2000	1700	865

Table 1: Characteristics of the images analyzed

From the data collected, it appears that the two least liked images are the images that present only architectural elements. One presents an aerial view of a central part of the city and the other, similar, highlights the old houses (July 28 and August 11). The most liked images, on the other hand, are those that highlight the region's climate (August 1 and 19), the same ones that have the greatest number of comments. They follow this choice with a lower index, but also based on nature, the images of September 6 and 22, and July 26.

The performance of digital design on the site under study consists in the selection of images previously posted by people or professional photographers, on the Instagram link. This selection happens without regularity, but it was observed that, in the analyzed interval, per month, three posts of this nature were made.

All posts from users and the administrator regarding them have been read. They are presented as shown in Table 2, below.

USER	ADMINISTRATOR
I love this fair !!!	Amazing, isn't, Marília?
Wonderful city	Beauty is in the eye of beholder!
Miss you ...	Come see me, Deborah! : D

Table 2: User and administrator demonstrations regarding photos

In the case of users, comments are generally restricted to adjectives of admiration for the city. Citizens or visitors use the adjectives beautiful, wonderful or expressions like “dear city” and “I love” a lot. They also often refer to the climate, saying that they like the cold and the rain, calling it Chuvitiba. Some, who are out of town, speak of homesickness or would like to have an equal city. Few comments on the photo itself appear. The inclusion of dingbats¹⁷ is frequent, being hearts, faces, puppies and some gifs¹⁸.

On the manager’s side, the response approach is very intimate and cheerful and carries graphic elements that reinforce the intention of the communication. City Hall’s responses take the city as a character. They also include dingbats and gifs, similar to those of users. But, in the case of complaints that are not linked to the image, the administrator ignores them, making no comment, as in the case of the next comment: “I strongly beg the competent body to visit the street Bernardino Iatauro – Orleans Curitiba – PR, 82310-380”¹⁹.

In the case of the study carried out, it appears that the service offered to users consists of transmitting an image of the city, generally related to the season, with landscapes that present local historic buildings, plants and people. Users make generally adjectives, but short comments. Some rare comments on problems encountered appear in isolation.

THE “SWARM” IN SMART CITIES

The field study, although restricted in terms of the elements analyzed, demonstrates in several ways what the analyzed authors present as a characteristic of digital communication in contemporary times.

It can be said that smart cities, when they also become commodities, first turn into a spectacle and, by assuming this, put their main characteristic in check, that of considering quality of life, through citizen participation. Communication, apparently egalitarian, is actually one-sided, isolated, without real communication, as can be seen in the comments of administrators and tanners. It is passive, supported by appearance, constituting a crossroads of virtualities. This can be seen on the Curitiba City Hall website.

Thus, in the study done, the possibility of a more open and democratic society, which would allow the discovery of new spaces of civic life, in which digital media could

¹⁷ Dingbats are fonts used as ornaments or characters.

¹⁸ Gifs (Graphis Interchange Format) are images in bit map format that can have movement.

¹⁹ Retrieved from <https://web.facebook.com/PrefsCuritiba/photos/a.516441535066322/2576549345722187/?type=3&theater>

facilitate consensus and promote social changes is not perceived. It consists of a space, without necessarily supporting itself in a particular place, or at a specific time.

Despite offering a series of mechanisms for user participation in the process of building their design, residents and visitors of cities, by becoming mere spectators, live the spectacle presented to them. As we have seen, the selected Facebook images of the city of Curitiba are images that glamorize its concept. *Curitiba my beautiful*, excludes the perspective of failure, lack, non-design. Issues that challenge this concept are ignored. The administrator, the designer, is not concerned with transparency, but with the spectacle.

The terrain / media on which communication takes place, as well as the terrain / city created by the images are characterized as non-spaces, due to the ephemeral presence of their content and their participants. What is presented is absent of consistency, of criticism. Through the images and texts analyzed, a narrative, a story, is not built. There is no construction of a common history, as the basis of design projects, with the full participation of citizens. It can be said that in the design of the Curitiba City Hall website it seems more fun than the construction of meanings. The seductive image consists of an autonomous image.

What is observed is an enumeration of posts. And the comments only reinforce more posts. Always positive, always beautiful. The fact is confirmed that digital photography is no longer a means of representation and reference to reality. In what the city has a history, sustainability and mobility, the images posted do not bring any reinforcement. *Curitiba my beautiful* is beautiful by nature, which could be anywhere else.

The posts reflect the typical selfishness of “digital swarms”. Each speaks for himself, little or no interaction exists between the various members. And the administrator reinforces the notion of identity in Curitiba, as a city with a diverse climate, cold and rain. Little or no reference to its people, its history. People do not exist and architecture is not valued. In this way, intelligent citizen participation is restricted to the passive consumption of information, losing its political role, threatening democracy. It constitutes a non-place, without the presence of others, a space for the spectacle, in which in the great circulation of people the lone individual prevails.

Thus, the smart city, in which the citizen participates and where a better life is built, does not seem to be the focus of the strategies presented by the Curitiba City Hall in the study. The common and the community are distant from the use of design to boost economic, social, cultural and environmental development. The promotion of an urban policy guided by sustainable and innovative design, which improves the quality of life of its members, is still far from being achieved.

As seen, *homo digitalis* does not meet, it does not build a knot. That is why it does not develop any political energy, not being able to act collectively, making joint action shrink and prevent the formation of an opposing questioning power. From what can be seen, in this digital community, the public space is strained and individualization sharpened.

If the site talks about wanting to talk to you, it doesn't happen in the analyzed posts. In the same way, local history and the ecological city are overlooked in the construction of identity. The mirror that is built is a mirror of the image without content. Dingbats and gifs do not allow further communication.

As seen in the study, the formation of conscience and opinion, the basis of the political decision-making process, seems to be exhausted. The communicational space that is presented does not allow the expansion of political awareness, demonstrating that the enumeration of phrases without reflection confirms the formation of a swarm. In this society of scandal, no indignation is allowed.

On the other hand, considering that politics needs images and political doctrines originate images, the absent images, opposed by the present images, lead to an alienation of the process, confirming the role of public policies aligned with neoliberalism, in which power and the possibility of manipulation are present. The use of user data as a source of data mining by the City of Curitiba is not even known. Individuals do not have their own collective profile. Without coherence, the construction of communication on the website is reactionary, without a socially progressive perspective.

Then, the impression of colonized is confirmed, without knowing by whom. You cannot assess drunkenness, blindness and the simultaneous stupidity to which you are subjected and in which you participate. The images of communication created by design are loaded with political forces, but they do not point to the construction of citizenship and, therefore, to an intelligent city.

Considering the above, it is considered essential to adopt more and more an epistemic vision of design for the social and cultural construction of digital and intelligent cities.

Although considering a very restricted universe, the study allowed to glimpse, through the theoretical contribution, problems specifically related to the focus on the city of Curitiba. With it, however, it can be seen that the realization of other works may confirm or reject studies that demonstrate the difficulties in inserting citizenship in digital media projects that provide communication between administrators and inhabitants of the cities they call themselves smart.

Thus, studies that analyze the reality presented here in greater depth can contribute to a more accurate view of the process. Likewise, new studies in other cities can expand the view of the process described by the analyzed authors.

Translation: Virginia Borges Kistmann

REFERENCES

- Andrade, P. (2018). A investigação híbrida: pontes e pontos de contato entre as tecnologias sociais e as ciências sociais. In J. Herrero & M. Trenta (Eds), *Comunicación y música: mensajes, manifestaciones y negocios* (pp. 134-135). La Laguna: Sociedad Latina de Comunicación Social. Retrieved from <http://www.cuadernosartesanos.org/2018/cac145.pdf>
- Augé, M. (1994). *Não-lugares: introdução a uma antropologia da supermodernidade*. Campinas: Papirus.

- Caragliu, A., del Bo, C. & Nijkamp, P. (2011). Smart cities in Europe. *Journal of Urban Technology*, 18(2), 65-82. <https://doi.org/10.1080/10630732.2011.601117>
- Castells, M. (2006). A Sociedade em rede: do conhecimento à política. In M. Castells & G. Cardoso (Eds.), *A sociedade em rede do conhecimento à ação política* (pp. 17- 30). Lisbon: Imprensa Nacional. Retrieved from http://www.egov.ufsc.br/portal/sites/default/files/anexos/a_sociedade_em_rede_-_do_conhecimento_a_acao_politica.pdf
- Castells, M. & Cardoso, G. (2006). Prefácio dos autores. In M. Castells & G. Cardoso (Eds.), *A sociedade em rede do conhecimento à ação política* (pp. 9-14). Lisbon: Imprensa Nacional. Retrieved from http://www.egov.ufsc.br/portal/sites/default/files/anexos/a_sociedade_em_rede_-_do_conhecimento_a_acao_politica.pdf
- Contreras, F. R. & Sanches, D.M. (2018). Métodos visuales. Análisis de la problemática visual entre la imagen icónica y la predicación política. In J. Herrero & M. Trenta (Eds.), *Comunicación y música: mensajes, manifestaciones y negocios* (pp. 914-926). La Laguna: Sociedad Latina de Comunicación Social. Retrieved from http://www.revistalatinacs.org/18SLCS/2018_libro2/o48_Contreras.pdf
- Debord, G. (2003). *A sociedade do espetáculo*. eBooksBrasil.com [eBook]. Retrieved from <http://www.cisc.org.br/portal/biblioteca/socespetaculo.pdf>
- Hefting, P. (2008). El compromise social del diseño público: El caso “Holanda”. In S. Fernández & G. Bonsiepe (Eds.), *Historia del diseño e America Latina y el Caribe: industrialización visual para la autonomia* (pp. 274-291). São Paulo: Blücher.
- Han, B-Ch. (2018). *No enxame. Perspectivas do digital*. Petrópolis: Vozes.
- Gibson, S. (2017, July 09). *Service Design 101*. Retrieved from <https://www.nngroup.com/articles/service-design-101/>
- Kozinets, R. (2017). Netnography: radical participative understanding for a networked communications society. In S. Willig & W. S. Rogers (Eds.), *The Sage handbuch of qualitative research in psychology* (pp.374-380). Los Angeles: Sage Publications.
- Mulgan, G. (2006) Moldar de novo o estado e a sua relação com os cidadãos: o potencial das tecnologias de comunicação e informação no curto, médio e longo prazo. In M. Castells & G. Cardoso (Eds.), *A sociedade em rede do conhecimento à ação política* (pp. 205-213). Lisbon: Imprensa Nacional. Retrieved from http://www.egov.ufsc.br/portal/sites/default/files/anexos/a_sociedade_em_rede_-_do_conhecimento_a_acao_politica.pdf
- Ruggeri, D. & Young, D. (2016). Community in the information age: exploring the social potential of web-based technologies in landscape architecture and community design. *Frontiers of Architectural Research*, 5(1), 15-25. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foar.2015.12.001>
- Sá, T. (2014). Lugares e não lugares em Marc Augé. *Tempo social*, 26(2), 209-229. <https://doi.org/10.1590/S0103-20702014000200012>
- Whiteley, N. (1993). *Design for society*. London: Reaktion Books.

BIOGRAPHICAL NOTE

Virginia Borges Kistmann is a designer Senior Lecturer at the Programa de Pesquisa e Pós-Graduação em Design – PPGDesign of the Federal University of Paraná – UFPR. Her research interests focus on the design management as an innovative element for

organizations. Presently, she coordinates the Design Management Group of UFPR and her current research focuses on the design insertion for public policies related to cities.

ORCID: <https://orcid.org/0000-0001-6845-6459>

Email: vkistmann@ufpr.br

Address: Rua XV de Novembro, 1299 | CEP 80.060-000, Centro Curitiba, PR, Brasil

Submitted: 14/09/2019

Accepted: 30/11/2019